

## 3040 Williams Drive

## Suite 200

**Fairfax, VA 22031**

**Meeting Minutes**

1. **Call to Order** Chairman Nohe

## Chairman Nohe called the meeting to order at 7:14 PM.

1. **Roll Call** Ms. Thomas-Jones Clerk
	* Voting Members: Chairman Nohe; Chair Randall; Chairman Bulova; Chair Cristol; Mayor Silberberg; Mayor Meyer; Mayor Parrish; Mayor Rishell; Councilmember Snyder; Mr. Kolb; Mr. Minchew; Senator Black; Delegate Hugo (via conference call).
	* Non-Voting Members: Ms. Cuervo; Mr. Horsley.
	* Staff: Monica Backmon (Executive Director); Michael Longhi (CFO); Harun Rashid (Transportation Planner); Peggy Teal (Assistant Finance Officer); Richard Stavros (Investment and Debt Manager); Sree Nampoothiri (Transportation Planner); Yolanda Thomas-Jones (Board Clerk); various jurisdictional and agency staff.

## Minutes of the November 8, 2018 Meeting

Mayor Rishell moved approval of the November 8, 2018 amended minutes; seconded by Mayor Parrish. Motion carried unanimously.

# Presentation

1. **Acknowledgment of Outgoing Authority Members** Chairman Nohe
	* Chairman Nohe acknowledged two outgoing Authority members, Mayor Silberberg (City of Alexandria) and Mayor Burk (Town of Leesburg).
		+ Chairman Nohe thanked Mayor Silberberg for her hard work and dedication as a member of the Authority and presented her with a memento commemorating her time on the Authority. Mayor Silberberg thanked the Authority members and staff as she reflected on her tenure on the Authority including the allocation of $70 million for the Potomac Yards Metro Station. She added it was a true honor to have served.
		+ Chairman Nohe also thanked Mayor Burk who was not present, noting that she will be honored at a future meeting.
2. **Economic Analysis of NVTA Funded Transportation Investments**

Mr. Longhi, CFO

* + Mr. Longhi presented a study on the Economic Analysis of NVTA Funded Transportation Projects.
		- The study purpose was to determine the economic impact of NVTA capital investments, building upon a study completed in 2016 and recapped in the 2016 Annual Report, with some expanded detail on regional and statewide impacts.
		- The study performed in 2016 was a reflection of the economic impacts within Northern Virginia through NVTA project investments.
		- The current study is the economic impacts throughout the Commonwealth.
		- Chmura Economics and Analytics was contracted to undertake the Economic Analysis Study using IMPLAN Pro, which is one of the most widely used economic impact assessment modeling systems.
	+ Mr. Longhi noted the study was undertaken using a recognized, transparent, repeatable modeling technique and assessment methodology which can be built upon in the future.
		- The study focused on the regional and state impact of the Authority’s project funding programs-(70% revenues) in addition to the impacts of the 30% revenue distribution funds.
		- There was no specific budget allocation for the study, so there were limits on the number of topics and data elements to give Chmura for the analysis.
	+ Mr. Longhi rounded out the study perspective highlighting $3 billion in investments combining the 30% funds and 70% funds from FY2014 through FY2024. FY2024 estimated revenue was included due the aspects of the model that incorporate spending timing.
		- The study focused on three impact areas: direct, indirect and induced. Direct impact is the economic activity generated by the specific project, including the materials, labor and equipment. Indirect impact is a secondary economic activity generated including need for more rental equipment, design software and services. The induced impact is payroll spending of people working on the project.
	+ Mr. Longhi discussed the economic impact of $3 billion in project funding.
		- The impact is split between the NOVA region and the Commonwealth as a whole.
		- With a total investment of $3 billion, the direct impacts are $2.5 billion. Mr. Longhi addressed the direct impact being a half billion less than the project funding by noting Virginia doesn’t have steel mills, so steel is imported into the state. Likewise, Virginia does not have bus assembly lines, so those economic activities happen outside the Commonwealth.
		- Most of the $3 billion raised in Northern Virginia, is actually being used in Virginia. The amount increases with the indirect and induced impacts.
			* From direct impact to total, Northern Virginia goes from about $2.5B to $4B. Mr. Longhi continued by stating the Commonwealth numbers are inclusive of the NOVA region amounts.
		- The State of Virginia sees a benefit of $410M statewide.
	+ Mr. Longhi discussed the employment numbers. The Northern Virginia direct impact starts with generating 13,600 jobs, State of Virginia starts with 13,750 jobs. When the regional indirect and induced impacts are added the total grows to 23,400 regional jobs, and 26,000 jobs throughout the Commonwealth. Mr. Longhi added that the $3 billion is raised in Northern Virginia and 90% of the jobs are staying in Northern Virginia.
	+ Mr. Longhi noted the monies reflected is only related to projects costs. The use of the projects was not included in the analysis.
	+ Mr. Longhi discussed the other impacts for the Northern Virginia region, noting:
		- Investment of $1.9 billion in 95 regional 70% funded projects through 122 Standard Project Agreements (SPAs). Mr. Longhi clarified that the Authority has more SPA’s than projects and a single project may have more than one SPA.
		- Mr. Longhi noted that whether NVTA funds the first project dollar to start a project or the last dollar to complete a project, it is seldom the only funding source for projects.
		- This results in the NVTA project investments triggering an additional $3.8 billion in local, state or federal funding, bringing the total to $5.7 billion in investments coming to Northern Virginia. The total project value of $5.7 billion was not a part of the Chmura analysis due to analysis cost constraints.
		- Mr. Longhi noted economic impacts which were outside the Chmura analysis. Principally, $3.1 billion in travel time delay savings through 2030. This savings was determined through TransAction Update analysis and assumes a $15/hour impact throughout Northern Virginia.
	+ Mr. Longhi discussed potential enhancements to the study, noting that Authority staff would like to take a closer look at the economic impact of funding matches that are currently at $3.8 billion and;
		- Deeper analysis into time value, benefits at $3.1 billion in time savings.
		- Further examination of mobility benefits that include congestion reduction, safety, environmental, vehicle operating cost savings.
		- Possibly complete an expanded employment opportunity analysis.
		- Include business opportunity impacts for the region and Commonwealth.
		- Expand and look at local tax analysis to include real estate, personal property and sales tax.
	+ Chair Randall asked Mr. Longhi about the $15/hour assumption used in the analysis. Mr. Longhi responded the $15/hour assumption was used as this is in tandem with what the Metropolitan Washington Council of Governments (MWCOG) use.
	+ Chair Randall noted the $15/hour is a conservative estimate. Mr. Longhi acknowledged this and agreed that given the labor pool in Northern Virginia, $15/hour is a conservative number. The $15/hour rate was used for consistency with MWCOG studies and it is close to the mid-point of the national rates used.
	+ Mayor Rishell asked if these numbers would be included in the talking points going to Richmond regarding the restoration of NVTA revenues. Mr. Longhi responded that Ms. Baynard has advised the Authority on what to include in the talking points regarding the restoration of NVTA revenues.
	+ Councilmember Snyder asked will the new jobs represented in the analysis go away once the projects are complete. Mr. Longhi responded that since the data covers a ten-year period, there is some staying power over the ten years. Mr. Longhi added that the Authority will continue to develop and adopt funding programs that will hopefully, over the years, increase and sustain continued employment.
	+ Councilmember Snyder mentioned the analysis seems to address short-term immediate impacts versus the longer term, more sustainable impacts. He stated that the true economic benefits are much larger than what is reflected in the slide presentation noting that NVTC tried to reflect the long term benefits in their study. Mr. Longhi responded, he completely agrees with Councilmember Snyder. He added, using a nationally recognized, outside expert with a recognized modeling plan, set a baseline so that the results from Northern Virginia can be compared to other regions. Mr. Longhi stated there was no budget appropriation for the study; it was done to support the Five Year Strategic Plan. He mentioned there is a January conference call scheduled with Chmura to discuss the potential to include more data points in the future to include the economic benefit of the project use, not just the impact of the project funding.
	+ Ms. Backmon added, the baseline is there, however the resources weren’t available to dig deeper. Mr. Longhi explained a limitation of the study is that is only addresses the spending of project funds, not project use, therefore not fully addressing the point Councilmember Snyder raised.
	+ Ms. Backmon noted, once the projects are completed, we could undertake a closer analysis. Ms. Backmon added that it is an additional threshold that will give percentages for the data points noted on Slide 7 of the presentation.
	+ Mr. Longhi spoke with the economists about the wealth of data in the TransAction Plan. He added, the economists were excited about having the data, but expanding the analysis requires additional resources and costs.

**Consent**

1. ~~Approval of Standard Project Agreement for Arlington County—Regional Funding 2018-001-1 (ART Operations and Maintenance Facilities)~~
2. **Approval of Standard Project Agreement for Arlington County—Regional Funding 2018-005-1 (Intelligent Transportation System Improvements)**
	* Mayor Parrish moved for a block approval of Items VII., VIII., IX., and X., in accordance with NVTA's approved Project Description Sheet as appended to the Standard Project Agreements; and authorize the Executive Director sign on behalf of the Authority, seconded by Chairman Bulova. Motion passed unanimously.
3. **Approval of Standard Project Agreement for Loudoun County—Regional Funding 2018-028-1 (Dulles West Boulevard Widening: Loudoun County Parkway to Northstar Boulevard)**
	* Mayor Parrish moved for a block approval of Items VII., VIII., IX., and X., in accordance with NVTA's approved Project Description Sheet as appended to the Standard Project Agreements; and authorize the Executive Director sign on behalf of the Authority, seconded by Chairman Bulova. Motion passed unanimously.
4. **Approval of Standard Project Agreement for Loudoun County—Regional Funding 2018-029-1 (Evergreen Mills Road Intersection Realignments)**
	* Mayor Parrish moved for a block approval of Items VII., VIII., IX., and X., in accordance with NVTA's approved Project Description Sheet as appended to the Standard Project Agreements; and authorize the Executive Director sign on behalf of the Authority, seconded by Chairman Bulova. Motion passed unanimously.
5. **Approval of Standard Project Agreement for Virginia Department of Transportation (VDOT)—Regional Funding 2018-024-1 (Route 28 Northbound Widening between Dulles Toll Road and Sterling Boulevard)**
	* Mayor Parrish moved for a block approval of Items VII., VIII., IX., and X., in accordance with NVTA's approved Project Description Sheet as appended to the Standard Project Agreements; and authorize the Executive Director sign on behalf of the Authority, seconded by Chairman Bulova. Motion passed unanimously.

#  Action

1. **Adoption of the 2019 Legislative Program** Chair Randall, GPC
	* Chair Randall sought NVTA approval of the draft 2019 State and Federal Legislative Program reviewed by the Governance and Personnel Committee (GPC) prior to the start of the Authority meeting, noting:
	* The GPC discussed if the draft legislative program should have more specific language as it relates to the restoration of long-term funding to the NVTA. Chair Randall stated that at the recommendation of Ms. Baynard, the GPC agreed that language that is more specific should be added when required. Chair Randall added the current broad, non-specific language would allow more flexibility regarding funding solutions.
	* Ms. Baynard added that the GPC tasked the Authority staff with bringing forth a set of principles that would guide future analysis and review of any proposals that come forward.
	* Chair Randall discussed amendments to the draft legislative program:
		+ The addition of a table in the chart that highlights the loss sustained due to the repeal of the Grantor’s Tax and Transient Occupancy Tax (TOT).
		+ The addition of language that speaks to the importance of technology as it relates to transportation as suggested by Councilmember Snyder.
		+ The removal of subsection 2 from Section C of the document.
	* Councilmember Snyder asked would the Authority support the restoration of funds if the restoration includes a tax increase. Ms. Baynard responded, that position would have to be something the Authority discusses further.
	* Mayor Parrish discussed his concerns that the General Assembly will misinterpret the Authority’s request for funding restoration as the Authority’s support of a tax increase to restore the funds. Ms. Baynard responded saying she would prepare a set of guidelines that cover a variety of scenarios and seek Authority guidance regarding the scenarios.
	* Senator Black stated that if it is suggested that the funding be replaced by imposing a third level of taxation on Northern Virginia, he would not be in support of that request.
	* Chair Randall added that the TOT loss was $162,843,631, and the Grantor’s Tax loss was $232,210,944. The total combined loss results in $118,459,000 over six years.
	* Chair Randall agreed with Mayor Parrish stating that verbiage be added to the legislative program specifying that the Authority requests restoration without any tax increases being imposed in Northern Virginia.
	* Chair Cristol encouraged the Authority to not be so pointed in expressing opposition to a tax increase that may preclude other solutions. Chair Cristol also expressed her disagreement with new taxes being imposed solely in Northern Virginia; stating that the additional verbiage statement should express that the Authority requests that the restoration of NVTA revenues come from statewide sources.
	* Delegate Hugo (participating via teleconference) apologized for his physical absence, stating that he is recovering from back surgery. Delegate Hugo acknowledged his agreement with no increased taxes for Northern Virginia residents and added it was a concern during the 2018 General Assembly session. He noted, he is looking forward to working with the legislators to ensure bipartisanship on both the House and Senate level, while ensuring the funding is secured for transportation needs. Delegate Hugo thanked the Authority for all its hard work.
	* Chairman Nohe summarized that the Authority’s position is consistent with guideline discussions from earlier in the year. He added that the Authority’s position does not invalidate the language currently in the draft legislative program.
	* Mayor Parrish agreed with Chairman Nohe. Mayor Parrish stated there needs to be an understanding of guidelines of what the Authority supports. Mayor Parrish stated he would hate to see leadership go the Richmond, representing the NVTA, and acquiescing to additional taxes for Northern Virginia.
	* Chair Randall mentioned that if the General Assembly discussions appear to interpret the restoration of funding as a need for regional tax increases, Ms. Baynard will immediately inform the Authority, who will in turn discuss and develop a more specific statement at that time. Chairman Bulova addressed the Authority’s efforts to have the same flexibility in which funding sources are the same funds many jurisdictions use to pay their share of NVTA operational costs.
	* Chairman Bulova used the support administration and operations expenses as the Hampton Roads Transportation Accountability Commission (HRTAC). She stated that she is comfortable with asking for the same flexibility as Hampton Roads regarding the use of regional revenues for the Authority’s operational and administrative expenses noting that many jurisdictions use their 30% funds to pay their share of NVTA operational costs, with Arlington County now being in the negative for a period regarding their 30% funding. Chairman Bulova expressed that parody with Hampton Roads and how their operations and administrative costs are covered, would help the member jurisdictions that had their 30% funds significantly reduced. She added that the Authority should exercise caution in legislative changes.
	* Chairman Nohe explained the Authority is seeking parody with the HRTAC who can pay for their operational and administrative expenses using their regional revenues. Currently, the Authority must pay using funds from the localities. He added, parody with HRTAC gives the Authority a safety net and the ability to make sure the operating expenses get paid even if local city councils or supervisors decide to not pay their bills.
	* Senator Black summarized the Authority is agreement with statewide money being used to restore funding. Chair Randall stated her support of verbiage being added to the legislative program that outlines the strong preference for funding restoration to come from statewide money.
	* Chair Randall moved Authority approval of the draft 2019 State and Federal Legislative Program, inclusive of any amendments made at the December 13, 2018, Authority meeting, one abstention, Delegate Hugo, seconded by Chair Cristol. Motion carried unanimously.
2. **Appointment of Chairman and Vice-Chairman for 2019**

Nominating Committee

* + Mayor Parrish moved Authority approval of the reappointment of Chairman Nohe and Chair Randall as Chairman and Vice-Chairman of the Northern Virginia Transportation Authority for 2019, seconded by Chair Bulova. Motion carried unanimously.
1. **Appointment of Town of Dumfries Mayor, Derrick Wood as the Town Representative for 2019** Chairman Nohe
	* Chairman Nohe moved Authority approval of Mayor Derrick Wood, Mayor of the Town of Dumfries, as the Town Representative to the Northern Virginia Transportation Authority for 2019, seconded by Senator Black. Motion carried unanimously.

# Discussion/Information

1. **Governance and Personnel Committee** Chair Randall, Chair, GPC
	* Chair Randall reported there was a closed session to discuss the Executive Director’s annual performance review, the recommendations should be come to the Authority in January 2019.
2. **Executive Director’s Report** Ms. Backmon, Executive Director
	* Ms. Backmon acknowledged and congratulated Ms. Cuervo, VDOT NoVA District Engineer, who was named 2018 Woman of the Year by the Washington, D.C. chapter of the Women’s Transportation Seminar for her leadership and contributions to transportation in the region spanning more than 30 years The Authority applauded and congratulated Ms. Cuervo. Ms. Cuervo thanked the members, staff and attendees for their support.
3. **Chairman’s Comments**
4. **Adjournment 8:14PM**

 **Next Meeting: January 10, 2019 at 7:00PM**

**NVTA Offices**